

COMPENDIUM OF PROJECT LESSONS LEARNED LOGS

for ODA LOAN-ASSISTED PROJECTS

(Completed/Closed Loans in CY 2013)



NATIONAL ECONOMIC & DEVELOPMENT AUTHORITY
Monitoring and Evaluation Staff

PROJECT LESSONS LEARNED LOGS
Completed Projects/Closed Loans in CY 2013

Project Title	Implementing Agency	Sector/Subsector	Development Partner	TPC (in Php M)
1. Second Women's Health and Safe Motherhood Project (WHSMP2)	DOH	Health	WB	749.40
2. Health Sector Development Project (HSDP)	DOH	Health	ADB	3,640.00
3. National Program Support for Tax Administration Reform (NPSTAR)	BIR	Tax and Revenue	WB	572.00
4. Help for Catubig Advancement Project (HCAAP)	NIA	Irrigation	JICA	3,259.30
5. Agno River Integrated Irrigation Project (ARIIP)	NIA	Irrigation	China	11,225.53
6. Mega Bridges for Urban and Rural Development Project (MBURD)	DPWH	Roads and Bridges	France	10,727.70
7. Post-Ondoy and Pepeng Short-Term Infrastructure Rehabilitation Project (POPSTRIP)	DPWH	Road and Bridges, Flood Control	JICA	6,480.00
8. Bridge Construction and Replacement Project (BCRP)	DPWH	Roads and Bridges	Spain	4,970.36
9. National Program Support for Environment and Natural Resources Management Project (NPSENRM)	DENR	Environment	WB	5,111.43

PROJECT LESSONS LEARNED LOG
Completed Project/Closed Loans in CY 2013

PROJECT TITLE: SECOND WOMEN'S HEALTH AND SAFE MOTHERHOOD PROJECT 2

PROJECT BASIC INFORMATION

Loan No:	2006 65 109	Status:	Completed/Closed
Project Title:	Second Women's Health and Safe Motherhood Project (2WHSMP)		
Implementing Agency:	DOH	Sector:	Social Development
Area Coverage:	Regions 5, and 13	Sub-sector:	Health, Nutrition and Population
Loan Amount:	US\$ 16 M		
Loan Signing Date:	30 June 2005	Effectivity Date:	28 December 2005
Loan Closing Date:	31 December 2013	Revised Closing Date:	-
Project Start Date:	Nov 2009	Completion Date:	31 December 2013
Total Project Cost:	PhP749.398 M	LP:PhP640 M	GOP:PhP109.398 M
Description:	The project consists of two main components; A) Local delivery of the Integrated Women's health and Safe mother hood service Package that support LGUs in mobilizing networks of public and private health providers in delivering the integrated WHSM service package and priority attention is given to the needs of disadvantaged women of reproductive age; and B- National Capacity to sustain WHSM Services capacities to create an operating environment conducive to LGUs managing and sustaining local delivery of the WHSMP-Sp and facilitate replication of the integrated WHSM model throughout the country.		
Objectives:	The project aims to introduce effective interventions to address women's health and safe motherhood concerns specifically disadvantaged women of reproductive age access to high quality and cost effective reproductive health.		

LESSONS LEARNED INFORMATION

	Issue Category	Project Phase	Date Identified	Situation	Task	Action Taken	Lessons Learned
1.	Procurement	Implementation	2012	The required human resources such as: Procurement and Financial Management Specialist, Monitoring and Evaluation specialist and Civil works specialist were not hired as planned due to procurement delays.	Hiring of the required human resources under the project	Workshop was organized to improve the procurement capacity of DOH. A procurement retooling workshop was held and attended by pre-identified DOH main stakeholders of procurement Such as the members of the bids and awards committee and its secretariat, staff of the Procurement Division and DOH Finance Service.	As identified during project design, although reforms has been made in the DOH processes, these reform measures have yet to be translated to efficiency in the turn-around of transactions at the various level of procurement and payment processes particularly in the selection of consultants and procurement of health goods. There is a need to build in capacity development programs on procurement aspects on a continuing basis.
2.	Scope	Implementation	2ndQTR 2008	Batch 2 province (Isabela)decided not to avail of the project	Roll out project activities in batch 2 provinces	Reallocation of loan proceeds to better performing components of the project such as subproject	The project has established the importance of ownership by the government, LGUs and implementation teams across all levels to facilitate project

	Issue Category	Project Phase	Date Identified	Situation	Task	Action Taken	Lessons Learned
						financing for PBGS	implementation. DOH to advocate and support the determination and building of capacities required at various levels of the health system to effectively manage LGU's support to health sector reforms.

Prepared by:

Name of Project Officer: Malou Eudela
Monitoring and Evaluation Unit: MES-SSD
Date Prepared: 22 September 2014

Verified by:

Division Chief: Aleli Lopez-Dee
Monitoring and Evaluation Unit: MES-SSD
Date Prepared: 22 September 2014

PROJECT LESSONS LEARNED LOG
Completed Project/Closed Loan in CY 2013

PROJECT TITLE: HEALTH SECTOR DEVELOPMENT PROJECT (HSDP)

PROJECT BASIC INFORMATION

Loan No:	2137 PHI	Status:	Closed
Project Title:	Health Sector Development Project (HSDP)		
Implementing Agency:	DOH	Sector:	Social Development
Area Coverage:	Regions 1, 2 ,4A, 4B and CAR	Sub-sector:	Health, Nutrition and Population
Loan Amount:	US\$ 13 M		
Loan Signing Date:	10 January 2005	Effectivity Date:	12 January 2005
Loan Closing Date:	31 December 2011	Actual Closing Date:	16 May 2013
Project Start Date:	January 2005	Completion Date:	30 September 2012
Total Project Cost:	PhP3,640 M	LP:PhP2,361 M	GOP:PhP1,279 M
Description:	The project is intended to finance well-defined investment and reform packages in support of the health system reform interventions espoused under the Health Sector Reform Agenda (HSRA) through the Fourmula One reform framework and now being undertaken under the Universal health care (Kalusugang Pangkalahatan) framework. The first component of the project focuses on the strengthening of implementation capacity at all levels under the leadership of the DOH. The second component directly supports the selected convergence sites in implementing reforms. The scope of the project is a) Health sector governance, b) Regulatory reforms, c) Health sector reforms at the LGU level, d) Hospital reforms and e) Public health reforms.		
Objectives:	The project aims to improve the health status of the poor, marginalized and vulnerable groups in the project provinces by increasing their access to and utilization of improved health services.		

LESSONS LEARNED INFORMATION

	Issue Category	Project Phase	Date Identified	Situation	Task	Action Taken	Lessons Learned
1.	Scope	Implementation	CY 2008	LGUs poorly complying with	Ensure that the facilities built were in	Regular coordination meetings with	Proactive supervision and technical assistance of DOH to LGUs needed to

	Issue Category	Project Phase	Date Identified	Situation	Task	Action Taken	Lessons Learned
				civil works requirements	accordance with the DOH standards.	the LGUs are conducted. Proactive supervision and technical assistance were provided to avoid bid failures and further delays in project activities. DOH also deployed architects and engineers to assist LGUs in the preparation of Detailed engineering and design.	ensure properly built hospitals and health facilities.
2.		Implementation	2013	Project implementation depended on the willingness and capacity of the participating LGUs	Procurement and construction of health facilities	DOH's extensive supervision and attention to all aspects of project implementation, including the coordination with the concerned LGUs and DOH hospital facilitated project implementation.	Proactive supervision and technical assistance of DOH to the participating LGUs

	Issue Category	Project Phase	Date Identified	Situation	Task	Action Taken	Lessons Learned
3.				LGUs given their administrative autonomy cannot always be expected to accede to the guidance of DOH. Thus their full commitment could not be presumed and their cooperation could not be guaranteed	Some LGUs backed out of the project.	Intensive coordination and supervision of remaining LGUs.	Project management requires dedicated supervision and regular assessment of performance.
4	Scope	Completion	CY 2013	Project design was broad and complex			Identification of focus and definition of design of future projects must be improved
5.	Procurement	Completion	CY 2013	Stakeholders had limited familiarity with ADB procurement procedures			Familiarity should not be assumed. Courses on such topics during the early stages of project implementation, or before project implementation if possible, would help.

Prepared by:

Name of Project Officer: Malou Eudela
Monitoring and Evaluation Unit: MES-SSD
Date Prepared: 22 September 2014

Verified by:

Division Chief: Aleli Lopez-Dee
Monitoring and Evaluation Unit: MES-SSD
Date Verified: 22 September 2014

PROJECT LESSONS LEARNED LOG
Completed Projects/Closed Loans in CY 2013

PROJECT TITLE: NATIONAL PROGRAM SUPPORT FOR TAX ADMINISTRATION (NPSTAR)

PROJECT BASIC INFORMATION

Loan No:	7431 – PH (WB)	Status:	Closed
Project Title:	National Program Support for Tax Administration Reforms		
Implementing Agency:	Department of Finance - Bureau of Internal Revenue (DOF – BIR)	Sector:	
Area Coverage:	Nationwide	Sub-sector:	
Loan Amount:	US\$11 Million		
Loan Signing Date:	30 March 2007	Effectivity Date:	25 June 2007
Loan Closing Date:	31 December 2011	Revised Closing Date:	30 June 2013
Project Start Date:	25 June 2007	Completion Date:	31 December 2011 (Revised: 30 June 2013)
Total Project Cost:	PhP572 Million	LP: PhP572 Million GP: NA	GOP: NA
Description:	The NPSTAR will finance specified expenditure line items in the regular national government budget within the established budget ceilings that are critical for tax administration reforms. It supports the following reform areas: (i) tax compliance; (ii) tax enforcement and control; (iii) human resource development and management; and (iv) BIR management and change management.		
Objectives:	The program aims to: (i) increase taxpayer compliance by increasing the efficiency and effectiveness of the BIR; and (ii) prepare the BIR for a sustainable and long-term reform.		

LESSONS LEARNED INFORMATION

	Issue Category	Project Phase	Date Identified	Situation	Task	Action/s Taken	Lessons Learned
	Time	Implementation	2 nd Quarter 2011	Project start-up delays	Prepare catch – up plan/ improve	DBCC Resolution No. 2011-4, dated 23 November	There should be lead time for agencies to prepare for project

	Issue Category	Project Phase	Date Identified	Situation	Task	Action/s Taken	Lessons Learned
					disbursement acceleration	2011 approved the request for extension of WB loan validity for NPSTAR by 18 months to catch up with lagging disbursement of the Project.	implementation phase. As experienced in NPSTAR, initial stages of the project were characterized with low disbursement figures. This could have been avoided if factors, such as institutional mechanisms as well as awareness on the Development Partners' guidelines are set in place/formulated prior to project implementation.
	Human Resources	Implementation	2 nd Quarter 2011	Delays in project implementation due to heavy workload and lack of capacity in financial management, procurement, and project management etc. of the project personnel.	Conduct training on the identified areas. Hire additional personnel as necessary.	Creation of Project Management and Implementation Service (PMIS) - Institutionalized the BIR Reform Unit with 17 personnel from the Tax Reforms Administration Group (TRAG) and additional seven (7) staff to be hired to complete the	Ensure that the personnel which are direct implementers of the Project are trained well prior to implementation.

	Issue Category	Project Phase	Date Identified	Situation	Task	Action/s Taken	Lessons Learned
						approved PMIS staffing complement.	
	Quality	Implementation	2 nd Quarter 2011	Overlap of activities for the NPSTAR and the MCC – assisted (Grant) Revenue Administration and Reform Project (RARP).	Converge the two projects.	No reported action from BIR.	Two (2) similar projects should simultaneously but complementary or must be implemented in a stepwise manner. If the projects are implemented by different bureaus, implementing entities must find points of commonality making them use available resources more efficiently.
	Time	Implementation	2nd Quarter 2012	Delays on the delivery of various information technology (IT) systems, i.e., Electronic Letter of Authority Monitoring System (eLAMs), Collection Reconciliation System (CRS) and Accounts Receivables	Extend target date for the delivery of the IT systems.	On-going system fixes for the eLAMs. Continuing Users' Acceptance Test (UAT) which resumed on Sept. 1, 2012 and extended up to January 31, 2013.	Projects which are heavy on IT systems are bound to have time extensions brought about mainly by incomplete and changing requirements and lack of user involvement.

	Issue Category	Project Phase	Date Identified	Situation	Task	Action/s Taken	Lessons Learned
				Conversion System (ARCS).			
	Procurement	Implementation	2nd Quarter 2012	In the case of the NPSTAR, the implementation extension was brought about by changes/additional requirements by the BIR that are not covered under the existing goods or consulting services contracts.	Ensure that users be available to test the system so issues can be raised and fixed immediately.	Contractors requested for another extension, specifically on the Software Solution for Tax Rulings and Case Management System.	For future projects, especially with IT – heavy components, to involve (even at the early stages of planning) the primary end users in order to thoroughly determine the requirements needed by the system.

Prepared by:

Name of Project Officer: Nikki Bermudez/ Dinna Manlangit
Monitoring and Evaluation Unit: MES-SSD
Date Prepared: 25 September 2014

Verified by:

Division Chief: Aleli Lopez-Dee
Monitoring and Evaluation Unit: MES-SSD
Date Verified: 22 September 2014

PROJECT LESSONS LEARNED LOG
Completed Project/Closed Loan in CY 2013

PROJECT TITLE: HELP FOR CATUBIG ADVANCEMENT PROJECT (HCAAP)

PROJECT BASIC INFORMATION

Loan No:	PH-P221	Status:	Closed
Project Title:	Help for Catubig Agricultural Advancement Project		
Implementing Agency:	DA-NIA	Sector:	AARNR
Area Coverage:	Region VIII (Northern Samar)	Sub-sector:	Agriculture/Irrigation
Loan Amount:	¥5,210 M		
Loan Signing Date:	30 May 2001	Effectivity Date:	23 January 2002
Loan Closing Date:	23 January 2011	Revised Closing Date:	23 January 2013
Project Start Date:	1 April 2002	Completion Date:	December 2013 (revised)
Total Project Cost:	PhP 3,259.3 M (Revised)	LP:PhP2,073.4M (revised)	GOP:PhP1,185.9 M
Description:	Construction of three (3) irrigation systems with an area of 4,550 hectares, flood protection and drainage facilities, improvement of rural infrastructures, Schistosomiasis control and other agricultural support services.		
Objectives:	The project aims to alleviate poverty by raising the income level of farmers, generate employment opportunities and improve the social infrastructures and services of the target area specifically to: (1) increase agricultural production by provision of irrigation and drainage facilities and extension of the road network; (2) strengthening the productive activities with the development of agricultural support services and institution; and, (3) enhancing public health through Schistosomiasis control and provision of basic social services.		

LESSONS LEARNED INFORMATION

	Issue Category	Project Phase	Date Identified	Situation	Task	Action Taken	Lessons Learned
1.	Scope		1Q32013	Since the Loan was closed last Jan 2013, the project was funded by GOP	Complete the remaining components of the project and meet the target	The project manager set series of coordination meetings and	The PMO should closely monitor and report the deliverables of the contractors to minimize delays. Also a concrete

	Issue Category	Project Phase	Date Identified	Situation	Task	Action Taken	Lessons Learned
				funds, but the project is still delivering slow progress report.	accomplishments.	instructed employees to prepare catch-up plans for the completion of every contract by June 2014.	catch up plan should be established and implemented to ensure the targets were really met.

Prepared by:

Name of Project Officer: Cheryl Tienzo
Monitoring and Evaluation Unit: MES-ESD
Date Prepared: 15 September 2014

Verified by:

Division Chief: Jesse T. David
Monitoring and Evaluation Unit: MES-ESD
Date Verified: 15 September 2014

PROJECT LESSONS LEARNED LOG
Completed Projects/Closed Loans in CY 2013

PROJECT TITLE: AGNO RIVER INTEGRATED IRRIGATION PROJECT (ARIIP)

PROJECT BASIC INFORMATION

Loan No:	CHI-6	Status:	Closed
Project Title:	Agno River Integrated Irrigation Project (ARIIP)		
Implementing Agency:	DA-NIA	Sector:	AARNR
Area Coverage:	Region I	Sub-sector:	Agriculture/Irrigation
Loan Amount:	US\$ 89.1538 M		
Loan Signing Date:	9 November 2009	Effectivity Date:	1 February 2010
Loan Closing Date:	31 December 2013	Revised Closing Date:	-
Project Start Date:	01 February 2010	Completion Date:	31 December 2013 (Revised)
Total Project Cost:	PhP 11, 225.532 M (revised)	LP:PhP4,301.220 M	GOP:PhP6,924.312 M
Description:	The Agno River Integrated Irrigation Project (formerly San Roque Multi-Purpose Project-Irrigation Component) is envisioned to provide year-round irrigation to some 34,450 hectares of farmlands to benefit 28,207 farm-families in the province of Pangasinan. The project is aimed to rehabilitate and construct irrigation and drainage facilities of two existing National Irrigation Systems (NIS) namely: the Agno River Irrigation System (ARIS) with a service area of 26,850 hectares and the Ambayaoan-Dipalo River Irrigation System (ADRIIS) with a service area of 7,600 hectares. The construction of a new Diversion Dam will serve as Re-regulating pond for the peak releases of the San Roque Power Corporation (SRPC) for irrigation purposes and the provision of a comprehensive institutional development program for the project.		
Objectives:	<p>The project aims to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Improve the operating performance of the covered systems through a modernization-based rehabilitation package. • Increase the crop yield and cropping intensity in the covered systems through physical and procedural innovations. • Enhance the farmers' crop income and living condition in the covered systems through increased crop production. • Stimulate economic activity in the service area through employment in the project and expanded farm activity. 		

LESSONS LEARNED INFORMATION

	Issue Category	Project Phase	Date Identified	Situation	Task	Action Taken	Lessons Learned
1.	Scope	Implementation	4Q2013	Delayed submission of project documentary requirements affected project implementation	Expedite preparation of critical requirement on time	PMO undertook additional effort to prepare and submit required documents (e.g. Detailed Engineering and Design, procurement documents) to lessen implementation delays	Early preparation of required project documents will have a factor on lessening implementation delays for the project.
2.	Human Resource	Implementation	4Q2013	PMO not fully established and has inadequate capacity on key project management activities	Establish a well-capacitated and trained PMO to support project implementation	PMO conducted capacity building activities such as seminars and trainings, Hired additional staff to support PMO operation	Establish well-capacitated and trained PMOs contributed to project efficiency in implementation and likelihood of achieving project objectives
3.	Procurement	Implementation	4Q2013	Prolonged procurement of goods, civil works and services resulted in implementation delays	Catch-up project implementation for project to be more efficient	Efforts to expedite procurement of civil works and services of the project carried out, Procurement activities were focused in	Conduct of pre-procurement activities should be made to avoid implementation delays related to procurement. A comprehensive procurement plan should also be prepared at project start up.

	Issue Category	Project Phase	Date Identified	Situation	Task	Action Taken	Lessons Learned
						expediting procurement activities	

Prepared by:

Name of Project Officer: Rhon Santos
Monitoring and Evaluation Unit: MES-ESD
Date Prepared: September 2014

Verified by:

Division Chief: Jesse T. David
Monitoring and Evaluation Unit: MES-ESD
Date Verified: 15 September 2014

PROJECT LESSONS LEARNED LOG
Completed Projects/Closed Loans in CY 2013

PROJECT TITLE: MEGA BRIDGES FOR URBAN AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT PROJECT (MBURD)

PROJECT BASIC INFORMATION

Loan No/Source:	France	Status:	Loan closed/Project ongoing
Project Title:	Mega Bridges for Urban and Rural Development (MBURD) Project		
Implementing Agency:	DPWH	Sector:	Infrastructure
Area Coverage:	All regions except II, CAR, NCR and ARMM	Sub-sector:	Transportation/Roads and Bridges
Loan Amount:	€148.857 M		
Loan Signing Date:	4 September 2008	Effectivity Date:	29 October 2008
Loan Closing Date (Original):	29 September 2012	Revised Closing Date:	29 September 2013
Project Start Date:	29 October 2008	Completion Date:	29 October 2016
Total Project Cost:	PhP10,727.70 M	LP:PhP9,452.42 M	GOP:PhP1,275.28 M
Description:	The project involves the nationwide construction, installation and establishment of a total of 10 girder-type flyovers with a total length of 1,955 lm and 72 universal bridges or national bridges with a total length of 2,594 lm along the country's congested highways and road network utilizing permanent prefabricated modular steel technology from France.		
Objectives:	The project aims to provide vital linkages or road network access along the Strong Republic Nautical Highway and Pan Philippine Highway, and to promote socio-economic growth in rural and urban centers.		

LESSONS LEARNED INFORMATION

	Issue Category	Project Phase	Date Identified	Situation	Task	Action Taken	Lessons Learned
1.	Time	Implementation	4Q2012	Disbursements slowed in light of the investigations conducted by the Senate Blue Ribbon Committee on ODA-	Ensure that all works are completed to achieve project objective	DPWH and the Supplier signed a Memorandum of Agreement (MOA) to withdraw the remaining loan	The Memorandum of Agreement (MOA) entered into by the DPWH and the Supplier, with approval of the

	Issue Category	Project Phase	Date Identified	Situation	Task	Action Taken	Lessons Learned
				assisted bridge programs. The project would not be completed within the loan closing date, as informed by DPWH a year before loan closing.		funds a few months before loan closing and deposit the same in an escrow account, subject to the approval of the lender (BNP Paribas). Part of the Supplier's commitment in the MOA was to remain fully engaged with the project until its revised completion in CY2016.	lender (BNP Paribas), was an innovative approach that enabled completion of remaining works using loan proceeds even after loan closing.
	Time	Implementation	3Q2011	Pre-construction delays and problems were experienced in the uncompleted flyovers, mostly due to difficulties in securing the support and acceptance of the concerned local governments, among other reasons.	Ensure that the flyovers in the target areas will be constructed as planned.	Continued coordination with the concerned LGUs	Improving the capability of DPWH ROW personnel is an urgent concern to support the implementation of national priority projects.
2.	Scope	Implementation	various	Necessary changes to the original list of bridges arose based on	Identify other bridges as replacement	DPWH informed NEDA about the	Program-type interventions such as MBURD have the

	Issue Category	Project Phase	Date Identified	Situation	Task	Action Taken	Lessons Learned
			1Q2014	<p>results of the assessment of actual site conditions.</p> <p>Earthquake-damaged bridges in the Bohol Circumferential Road, namely: a) Abatan bridge (90.47 lm); b) Moalong bridge (42.60 lm); and, c) Tagbuane bridge (22.50 lm), needed emergency action from GPH</p>	Identify ODA projects with available funds for emergency purposes.	<p>replacement bridges</p> <p>DPWH proposed the inclusion of the earthquake-damaged bridges in the scope of MBURD. ICC-CC noted on 30 June 2014 DPWH's proposed inclusion of the bridges with no change in cost.</p>	<p>advantage of easily realigning bridge materials/available funds to more urgent needs, such as the reconstruction/total replacement of bridges damaged during the October 2013 earthquake in Bohol, among others.</p>

Prepared by:

Name of Project Officer: Mildred F. Delos Reyes
Monitoring and Evaluation Unit: MES-TISD
Date Prepared: September 2014

Verified by:

Division Chief: Mon Corpuz
Monitoring and Evaluation Unit: MES-TSD
Date Verified: 15 September 2014

PROJECT LESSONS LEARNED LOG
Completed Project/Closed Loan in CY 2013

PROJECT TITLE: POST ONDOY AND PEPENG SHORT-TERM INFRASTRUCTURE REHABILITATION PROJECT (POPSTRIP)

PROJECT BASIC INFORMATION

Loan No/Source:	PH-P246/JICA	Status:	Loan closed
Project Title:	Post Ondoy and Pepeng Short-Term Infrastructure Rehabilitation Project (POPSTRIP)		
Implementing Agency:	DPWH	Sector:	Infrastructure
Area Coverage:	NCR, CAR, I, II, III, IV-A, IV-B and V	Sub-sector:	Roads and Bridges/Flood Control
Loan Amount:	JPY9,912 M		
Loan Signing Date:	26 May 2010	Effectivity Date:	21 September 2010
Loan Closing Date (Original):	21 September 2013	Revised Closing Date:	-
Project Start Date:	21 September 2010	Completion Date:	21 September 2013
Total Project Cost:	PhP6,480.00 M	LP:PhP5,312.00 M	GOP:PhP1,168.00 M
Description:	The project is composed of two (2) components, namely: (a) Rehabilitation of Flood Control Facilities and (b) Rehabilitation of National Roads and Bridges i.e., involving the repair and/or rehabilitation of flood control infrastructures, and roads and bridges damaged by Typhoons Ondoy and Pepeng to at least their conditions and functions prior to the onslaught of the typhoons. For flood control, repair works consist of restoration of embankments, slope protection, bank protection and other drainage facilities. Repair and rehabilitation works for roads and bridges consist of immediate restoration of cut road sections, clearing of landslides, asphalt overlay of damaged carriageways, restoration of damaged bridge structures and approaches, and installation of road signs and markers.		
Objectives:	The project aims to provide protection from further damages and restore access to various socio-economic activities in typhoons “Ondoy” and “Pepeng”-affected areas and thereby contribute to the safety of the residents and sustainable economic development in the areas.		

LESSONS LEARNED INFORMATION

	Issue Category	Project Phase	Date Identified	Situation	Task	Action Taken	Lessons Learned
1.	Procurement	Implementation	1Q2011	The emergency nature of the project called for the use of an alternative mode of procurement (i.e. negotiated contract) instead of the preferred competitive bidding. There were allegations of irregularity committed in the procurement process.	Clear-up alleged irregularities; ensure transparency in the bidding process	DPWH conducted rebidding of several civil works contracts under the flood control component of the project that were the subject of alleged procurement irregularities	Transparency is an important element in procurement. This was stressed with the cancellation and re-bidding of several negotiated civil works contracts under the flood control component of the project.
2.	Procurement /Scope	Implementation	3Q2011/ 1Q2013	A large amount of savings was generated as a result of lower bids than estimates.	Maximize loan utilization	DPWH proposed inclusion of supplemental scope 1 and 2 as a result of project savings. The ICC approved the proposals in October 2011 and February 2013, respectively.	The shift in the mode of procurement from local competitive bidding or direct contracting to open competitive bidding proved beneficial to the GPH in that additional sub-projects were implemented using generated savings.
3.	M&E	Evaluation	3Q2013	At loan closing in September 2013, not all the ICC-approved	Ensure completion of all remaining works	Implementation/ completion of the remaining	The Project Completion Report, once submitted, will

	Issue Category	Project Phase	Date Identified	Situation	Task	Action Taken	Lessons Learned
				works were completed.		works was pursued after loan closing using local funds.	establish whether the objective of the project was indeed achieved.
4.	Viability	Appraisal	1Q2010/ 1Q2013	There was no computation of economic indicators in the ICC evaluation/ re-evaluation of the project.	Ensure viability of sub-projects prior to implementation	ICC suggested that an inter-agency sub-approval committee be created which shall be tasked to evaluate each sub-project, but the DPWH informed that such action will delay project implementation and defeat the purpose for which the loan was intended. Instead, the DPWH committed that any change in the list of sub-projects will be submitted to NEDA for approval, to	Wise use of financial resources demands that viability of projects is ensured prior to implementation.

	Issue Category	Project Phase	Date Identified	Situation	Task	Action Taken	Lessons Learned
						which NEDA concurred.	

Prepared by:

Name of Project Officer: Krizelda Marie L. Songco
Monitoring and Evaluation Unit: MES-TISD
Date Prepared: 18 August 2014

Verified by:

Division Chief: Mon Corpuz
Monitoring and Evaluation Unit: MES-TSD
Date Verified: 15 September 2014

PROJECT LESSONS LEARNED LOG
Completed Projects/Closed Loans in CY 2013

PROJECT TITLE: BRIDGE CONSTRUCTION AND REPLACEMENT PROJECT (BCRP)

PROJECT BASIC INFORMATION

Loan No/Source:	Spain	Status:	Loan closed/Project ongoing
Project Title:	Bridge Construction and Replacement Project (BCRP)		
Implementing Agency:	DPWH	Sector:	Infrastructure
Area Coverage:	All regions except NCR and ARMM	Sub-sector:	Transportation/Roads and Bridges
Loan Amount:	€30.363 M (equally shared by Instituto de Credito Oficial of the Kingdom of Spain and Deutsche Bank Sociedad Anonoma Española)		
Loan Signing Date:	6 November 2009	Effectivity Date:	10 Feb 2010*/18 Feb 2010**
Loan Closing Date (Original):	10 Jun 2013*/18 Feb 2013**	Revised Closing Date:	27 Nov 2013*/11 Sep 2013**
Project Start Date:	10 Feb 2010	Completion Date:	31 Dec 2015
Total Project Cost:	PhP4,970.36 M	LP:PhP3,137.46 M	GOP:PhP1,832.90 M
Description:	The project involves the construction/replacement of 91 new and temporary weakened bridges with a length of 3,675 lm (from the originally ICC-approved 100 bridges with total length of 5,660 lm) using modular steel bridging technology.		
Objectives:	The project aims to reduce travel time, reduce travel costs, and enhance the safety of the people traversing river crossings in areas covered by the Project.		

*Loan from Instituto de Credito Oficial of the Kingdom of Spain

** Loan from Deutsche Bank Sociedad Anonoma Española

LESSONS LEARNED INFORMATION

	Issue Category	Project Phase	Date Identified	Situation	Task	Action Taken	Lessons Learned
1.	Time	Implementation	various	Start-up issues resulted in project delays. In addition, disbursements	Ensure that all works are completed to	DPWH requested the extension of project implementation period up to	In line with good governance and with the Senate Blue Ribbon

	Issue Category	Project Phase	Date Identified	Situation	Task	Action Taken	Lessons Learned
				slowed in light of the investigations conducted by the Senate Blue Ribbon Committee on ODA-assisted bridge programs.	achieve project objectives	December 2015, which the ICC approved on 3 July 2012. The ICC approval also involved getting a supplemental loan to fund a change in implementation arrangement.	Committee inquiry as backdrop, DPWH only pursued to obtain the supplemental loan after a year of ICC approval, at a time when the competitive cost of the project was doubly ensured and all government requirements and justifications were available and complied with.
2.	Cost	Implementation	various	Start-up issues and other problems resulted in project delays.	Explore other implementation arrangements to speed-up/facilitate implementation	DPWH requested ICC approval of a supplemental loan to fund the change in implementation arrangement wherein the DPWH will implement the civil works construction of 47 priority bridges using GPH funds, while the remaining 43 bridges will be implemented by the Supplier (Centunion) using the	Transforming the supply contract into a turnkey contract facilitates coordination of project implementation between DPWH and Centunion. Previously, coordination was done by DPWH with a number of contractors.

	Issue Category	Project Phase	Date Identified	Situation	Task	Action Taken	Lessons Learned
						supplemental loan. Originally, the DPWH was responsible for implementation of all 90 bridges. The ICC approved the request on 3 July 2012.	
3.	M&E	Implementation	4Q2012	Implementation was significantly delayed due to the investigations conducted by the Senate Blue Ribbon Committee on ODA-assisted bridge programs.	Ensure that all works are completed to achieve project objective	DPWH provided the Senate Blue Ribbon Committee all the requested documents on bridge programs	The readily available information in DPWH data system was beneficial in facilitating the Blue Ribbon Committee discussions on bridge projects.

Prepared by:

Name of Project Officer: Mildred F. Delos Reyes
Monitoring and Evaluation Unit: MES-TISD
Date Prepared: September 2014

Verified by:

Division Chief: Mon Corpuz
Monitoring and Evaluation Unit: MES-TSD
Date Verified: 15 September 2014

PROJECT LESSONS LEARNED LOG
Completed Project/Closed Loan in CY 2013

PROJECT TITLE: NATIONAL PROGRAM SUPPORT FOR ENVIRONMENT AND NATURAL RESOURCES MANAGEMENT PROJECT (NPSENRMPP)

PROJECT BASIC INFORMATION

Loan No:	7470-PH	Status:	Closed
Project Title:	National Program Support for Environment and Natural Resources Management Project		
Implementing Agency:	DENR	Sector:	ENR
Area Coverage:	Nationwide	Sub-sector:	Environment
Loan Amount:	US\$ 50 M		
Loan Signing Date:	29 Aug 2007	Effectivity Date:	27 Nov 2007
Loan Closing Date:	31 Dec 2012	Revised Closing Date:	-
Project Start Date:	27 Nov 2007	Completion Date:	31 Dec 2012
Total Project Cost:	PhP5,111.43 M	LP:PhP3,166.03 M	GOP:PhP1,945.40 M
Description:	The project consists of three (3) major components: Part (1) – Policy Development, Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation; Part (2) – Integrated Ecosystem Management; and Part (3) – Environmental and Natural Resources Management.		
Objectives:	The project's major objectives are to assist DENR to improve its efficiency and effectiveness in its service delivery; and enhance ecosystem services for global and local benefits.		

LESSONS LEARNED INFORMATION

	Issue Category	Project Phase	Date Identified	Situation	Task	Action Taken	Lessons Learned
1.	Institutional	Implementation	4Q2013	Delays in seedling production resulted in delayed implementation of the National Greening Program component that are	(NGP)- National Coordinating Office, FMB and FASPO to identify bottlenecks and resolve to	FMB and NGP are continuously monitored NGP activities and provided TA and guidance to field offices. Weekly reporting of	Capacity building activities on seedling production should have been provided to project stakeholders in line with project implementation to ensure smooth implementation.

	Issue Category	Project Phase	Date Identified	Situation	Task	Action Taken	Lessons Learned
				causing delays in seedling production	address the issue	status of NGP implementation done during the DENR ExeCom Meeting	
2.	Financial	Implementation	4Q2013	Slow processing of liquidation reports caused slow financial disbursement and fund replenishments	FASPO and other oversight offices to closely monitor the progress of preparation of liquidation reports of the concerned units and provide constant reminders, if necessary.	Financial Management Service (FMS) and FASPO conducted series of financial validation and reconciliation to concerned regions to facilitate submission of liquidation reports of NPS-ENRMP related expenditures. It was likewise supplemented with a Memorandum issued by FMS to concerned Bureaus/Regions/Offices reminding them of the submission of said liquidation	<p>Capacities on financial management i.e. liquidation reporting, among others, should be developed vis-à-vis the project.</p> <p>A well-established financial management system necessary to ensure funds are timely and adequately provided.</p>

	Issue Category	Project Phase	Date Identified	Situation	Task	Action Taken	Lessons Learned
						reports. FMS is currently consolidating the reports, for subsequent endorsement to WB, deadline is until end of April 2014.	
3.	Procurement	Implementation	4Q2013	Non-issuance of DBM of requested SARO amounting to PHP19 million caused delays in implementation of additional LGU subprojects that would result in the underutilization of the grant amount of US\$7 million	Follow-up/coordination with DBM	Several coordination meetings and follow-ups were undertaken.	Timely availability of funds for subprojects will facilitate completion on-time

Prepared by:

Name of Project Officer: Jerome Z. Jovellanos
Monitoring and Evaluation Unit: MES-ESD
Date Prepared: 22 September 2014

Verified by:

Division Chief: Jesse T. David
Monitoring and Evaluation Unit: MES-ESD
Date Verified: 15 September 2014